

proposition that local retail shopping has, to date, been reduced as a result of inbound or outbound telemarketing. And, the fact remains that, other than DeHart, none of the commenters, including major sellers, telemarketers, and industry groups, provides any evidence relating to the potential for a national "do-not-call" registry to result in a reduction in service or an increase in cost for inbound telemarketing, nor in a concomitant increase in retail shopping done in local malls.

Moreover, the Commission believes there can be no hard evidence on which to base a prediction of consumers' actions following the implementation of the "do-not-call" registry provision. It seems likely, based on the experience of states that have implemented statewide "do-not-call" lists, and the overwhelmingly high response of consumers to the Commission's proposal, that many consumers will avail themselves of the opportunity to place their telephone numbers on the national "do-not-call" registry. However, as noted above, this may or may not have any impact on consumers' decision to shop at local malls, or on their choice of transportation. Thus, while consumer behavior may change as a result of the promulgation of amendments to the Rule, such changes cannot be quantified or even reasonably estimated because consumer decisions are influenced by many variables other than existence of the "do-not-call" registry. Any indirect impact of the amended Rule on the environment would therefore be highly speculative and impossible to accurately predict or measure.

The Commission does not believe that any alternative to creating a national "do-not-call" registry would both provide the benefits of the registry and ameliorate all potential concerns regarding environmental impact. For example, the Commission does not believe that given its justification for the necessity of the registry, eliminating the provision from the amended Rule would be appropriate based solely on the unsupported allegations of indirect environmental effect raised in the DeHart comment. Furthermore, the Commission can think of no alternative other than eliminating the national "do-not-call" registry that would address DeHart's unsupported and highly speculative concern.

In sum, although any evaluation of the environmental impact of the amendments to the TSR is uncertain and highly speculative, the Commission finds no evidence of avoidable adverse impacts stemming from the amended Rule. Therefore, the Commission has

determined, in accordance with § 1.83 of the FTC's Rules of Practice, that no environmental assessment or EIS is required.¹⁰⁷⁵

List of Subjects in 16 CFR Part 310.

Telemarketing, Trade practices.

Accordingly, title 16, part 310 of the Code of Federal Regulations, is revised to read as follows:

PART 310—TELEMARKETING SALES RULE

Sec.

- 310.1 Scope of regulations in this part.
- 310.2 Definitions.
- 310.3 Deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.
- 310.4 Abusive telemarketing acts or practices.
- 310.5 Recordkeeping requirements.
- 310.6 Exemptions.
- 310.7 Actions by states and private persons.
- 310.8 Reserved: Fee for access to "do-not-call" registry.
- 310.9 Severability.

Authority: 15 U.S.C. 6101–6108.

§ 310.1 Scope of regulations in this part.

This part implements the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act, 15 U.S.C. 6101–6108, as amended.

§ 310.2 Definitions.

(a) *Acquirer* means a business organization, financial institution, or an agent of a business organization or financial institution that has authority from an organization that operates or licenses a credit card system to authorize merchants to accept, transmit, or process payment by credit card through the credit card system for money, goods or services, or anything else of value.

(b) *Attorney General* means the chief legal officer of a state.

(c) *Billing information* means any data that enables any person to access a customer's or donor's account, such as a credit card, checking, savings, share or similar account, utility bill, mortgage loan account, or debit card.

(d) *Caller identification service* means a service that allows a telephone subscriber to have the telephone number, and, where available, name of the calling party transmitted contemporaneously with the telephone call, and displayed on a device in or connected to the subscriber's telephone.

(e) *Cardholder* means a person to whom a credit card is issued or who is authorized to use a credit card on behalf

of or in addition to the person to whom the credit card is issued.

(f) *Charitable contribution* means any donation or gift of money or any other thing of value.

(g) *Commission* means the Federal Trade Commission.

(h) *Credit* means the right granted by a creditor to a debtor to defer payment of debt or to incur debt and defer its payment.

(i) *Credit card* means any card, plate, coupon book, or other credit device existing for the purpose of obtaining money, property, labor, or services on credit.

(j) *Credit card sales draft* means any record or evidence of a credit card transaction.

(k) *Credit card system* means any method or procedure used to process credit card transactions involving credit cards issued or licensed by the operator of that system.

(l) *Customer* means any person who is or may be required to pay for goods or services offered through telemarketing.

(m) *Donor* means any person solicited to make a charitable contribution.

(n) *Established business relationship* means a relationship between a seller and a consumer based on:

(1) the consumer's purchase, rental, or lease of the seller's goods or services or a financial transaction between the consumer and seller, within the eighteen (18) months immediately preceding the date of a telemarketing call; or

(2) the consumer's inquiry or application regarding a product or service offered by the seller, within the three (3) months immediately preceding the date of a telemarketing call.

(o) *Free-to-pay conversion* means, in an offer or agreement to sell or provide any goods or services, a provision under which a customer receives a product or service for free for an initial period and will incur an obligation to pay for the product or service if he or she does not take affirmative action to cancel before the end of that period.

(p) *Investment opportunity* means anything, tangible or intangible, that is offered, offered for sale, sold, or traded based wholly or in part on representations, either express or implied, about past, present, or future income, profit, or appreciation.

(q) *Material* means likely to affect a person's choice of, or conduct regarding, goods or services or a charitable contribution.

(r) *Merchant* means a person who is authorized under a written contract with an acquirer to honor or accept credit cards, or to transmit or process for payment credit card payments, for the

¹⁰⁷⁵ 16 CFR 1.83. See also *National Citizens Comm. for Broad. v. FCC*, 567 F.2d 1095, 1098 n.3 (D.C. Cir. 1977).

purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution.

(s) *Merchant agreement* means a written contract between a merchant and an acquirer to honor or accept credit cards, or to transmit or process for payment credit card payments, for the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution.

(t) *Negative option feature* means, in an offer or agreement to sell or provide any goods or services, a provision under which the customer's silence or failure to take an affirmative action to reject goods or services or to cancel the agreement is interpreted by the seller as acceptance of the offer.

(u) *Outbound telephone call* means a telephone call initiated by a telemarketer to induce the purchase of goods or services or to solicit a charitable contribution.

(v) *Person* means any individual, group, unincorporated association, limited or general partnership, corporation, or other business entity.

(w) *Preacquired account information* means any information that enables a seller or telemarketer to cause a charge to be placed against a customer's or donor's account without obtaining the account number directly from the customer or donor during the telemarketing transaction pursuant to which the account will be charged.

(x) *Prize* means anything offered, or purportedly offered, and given, or purportedly given, to a person by chance. For purposes of this definition, chance exists if a person is guaranteed to receive an item and, at the time of the offer or purported offer, the telemarketer does not identify the specific item that the person will receive.

(y) *Prize promotion* means:

(1) A sweepstakes or other game of chance; or

(2) An oral or written express or implied representation that a person has won, has been selected to receive, or may be eligible to receive a prize or purported prize.

(z) *Seller* means any person who, in connection with a telemarketing transaction, provides, offers to provide, or arranges for others to provide goods or services to the customer in exchange for consideration.

(aa) *State* means any state of the United States, the District of Columbia, Puerto Rico, the Northern Mariana Islands, and any territory or possession of the United States.

(bb) *Telemarketer* means any person who, in connection with telemarketing, initiates or receives telephone calls to or from a customer or donor.

(cc) *Telemarketing* means a plan, program, or campaign which is

conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution, by use of one or more telephones and which involves more than one interstate telephone call. The term does not include the solicitation of sales through the mailing of a catalog which: contains a written description or illustration of the goods or services offered for sale; includes the business address of the seller; includes multiple pages of written material or illustrations; and has been issued not less frequently than once a year, when the person making the solicitation does not solicit customers by telephone but only receives calls initiated by customers in response to the catalog and during those calls takes orders only without further solicitation. For purposes of the previous sentence, the term "further solicitation" does not include providing the customer with information about, or attempting to sell, any other item included in the same catalog which prompted the customer's call or in a substantially similar catalog.

(dd) *Upselling* means soliciting the purchase of goods or services following an initial transaction during a single telephone call. The upsell is a separate telemarketing transaction, not a continuation of the initial transaction. An "external upsell" is a solicitation made by or on behalf of a seller different from the seller in the initial transaction, regardless of whether the initial transaction and the subsequent solicitation are made by the same telemarketer. An "internal upsell" is a solicitation made by or on behalf of the same seller as in the initial transaction, regardless of whether the initial transaction and subsequent solicitation are made by the same telemarketer.

§ 310.3 Deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.

(a) *Prohibited deceptive telemarketing acts or practices.* It is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for any seller or telemarketer to engage in the following conduct:

(1) Before a customer pays¹ for goods or services offered, failing to disclose truthfully, in a clear and conspicuous manner, the following material information:

(i) The total costs to purchase, receive, or use, and the quantity of, any goods

¹ When a seller or telemarketer uses, or directs a customer to use, a courier to transport payment, the seller or telemarketer must make the disclosures required by § 310.3(a)(1) before sending a courier to pick up payment or authorization for payment, or directing a customer to have a courier pick up payment or authorization for payment.

or services that are the subject of the sales offer;²

(ii) All material restrictions, limitations, or conditions to purchase, receive, or use the goods or services that are the subject of the sales offer;

(iii) If the seller has a policy of not making refunds, cancellations, exchanges, or repurchases, a statement informing the customer that this is the seller's policy; or, if the seller or telemarketer makes a representation about a refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policy, a statement of all material terms and conditions of such policy;

(iv) In any prize promotion, the odds of being able to receive the prize, and, if the odds are not calculable in advance, the factors used in calculating the odds; that no purchase or payment is required to win a prize or to participate in a prize promotion and that any purchase or payment will not increase the person's chances of winning; and the no-purchase/no-payment method of participating in the prize promotion with either instructions on how to participate or an address or local or toll-free telephone number to which customers may write or call for information on how to participate;

(v) All material costs or conditions to receive or redeem a prize that is the subject of the prize promotion;

(vi) In the sale of any goods or services represented to protect, insure, or otherwise limit a customer's liability in the event of unauthorized use of the customer's credit card, the limits on a cardholder's liability for unauthorized use of a credit card pursuant to 15 U.S.C. 1643; and

(vii) If the offer includes a negative option feature, all material terms and conditions of the negative option feature, including, but not limited to, the fact that the customer's account will be charged unless the customer takes an affirmative action to avoid the charge(s), the date(s) the charge(s) will be submitted for payment, and the specific steps the customer must take to avoid the charge(s).

(2) Misrepresenting, directly or by implication, in the sale of goods or services any of the following material information:

(i) The total costs to purchase, receive, or use, and the quantity of, any goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer;

² For offers of consumer credit products subject to the Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 *et seq.*, and Regulation Z, 12 CFR 226, compliance with the disclosure requirements under the Truth in Lending Act and Regulation Z shall constitute compliance with § 310.3(a)(1)(i) of this Rule.

(ii) Any material restriction, limitation, or condition to purchase, receive, or use goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer;

(iii) Any material aspect of the performance, efficacy, nature, or central characteristics of goods or services that are the subject of a sales offer;

(iv) Any material aspect of the nature or terms of the seller's refund, cancellation, exchange, or repurchase policies;

(v) Any material aspect of a prize promotion including, but not limited to, the odds of being able to receive a prize, the nature or value of a prize, or that a purchase or payment is required to win a prize or to participate in a prize promotion;

(vi) Any material aspect of an investment opportunity including, but not limited to, risk, liquidity, earnings potential, or profitability;

(vii) A seller's or telemarketer's affiliation with, or endorsement or sponsorship by, any person or government entity;

(viii) That any customer needs offered goods or services to provide protections a customer already has pursuant to 15 U.S.C. 1643; or

(ix) Any material aspect of a negative option feature including, but not limited to, the fact that the customer's account will be charged unless the customer takes an affirmative action to avoid the charge(s), the date(s) the charge(s) will be submitted for payment, and the specific steps the customer must take to avoid the charge(s).

(3) Causing billing information to be submitted for payment, or collecting or attempting to collect payment for goods or services or a charitable contribution, directly or indirectly, without the customer's or donor's express verifiable authorization, except when the method of payment used is a credit card subject to protections of the Truth in Lending Act and Regulation Z,³ or a debit card subject to the protections of the Electronic Fund Transfer Act and Regulation E.⁴ Such authorization shall be deemed verifiable if any of the following means is employed:

(i) Express written authorization by the customer or donor, which includes the customer's or donor's signature;⁵

(ii) Express oral authorization which is audio-recorded and made available

upon request to the customer or donor, and the customer's or donor's bank or other billing entity, and which evidences clearly both the customer's or donor's authorization of payment for the goods or services or charitable contribution that are the subject of the telemarketing transaction and the customer's or donor's receipt of all of the following information:

(A) The number of debits, charges, or payments (if more than one);

(B) The date(s) the debit(s), charge(s), or payment(s) will be submitted for payment;

(C) The amount(s) of the debit(s), charge(s), or payment(s);

(D) The customer's or donor's name;

(E) The customer's or donor's billing information, identified with sufficient specificity such that the customer or donor understands what account will be used to collect payment for the goods or services or charitable contribution that are the subject of the telemarketing transaction;

(F) A telephone number for customer or donor inquiry that is answered during normal business hours; and

(G) The date of the customer's or donor's oral authorization; or

(iii) Written confirmation of the transaction, identified in a clear and conspicuous manner as such on the outside of the envelope, sent to the customer or donor via first class mail prior to the submission for payment of the customer's or donor's billing information, and that includes all of the information contained in

§§ 310.3(a)(3)(ii)(A)-(G) and a clear and conspicuous statement of the procedures by which the customer or donor can obtain a refund from the seller or telemarketer or charitable organization in the event the confirmation is inaccurate; *provided*, however, that this means of authorization shall not be deemed verifiable in instances in which goods or services are offered in a transaction involving a free-to-pay conversion and preacquired account information.

(4) Making a false or misleading statement to induce any person to pay for goods or services or to induce a charitable contribution.

(b) *Assisting and facilitating.* It is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a person to provide substantial assistance or support to any seller or telemarketer when that person knows or consciously avoids knowing that the seller or telemarketer is engaged in any act or practice that violates §§ 310.3(a), (c) or (d), or § 310.4 of this Rule.

(c) *Credit card laundering.* Except as expressly permitted by the applicable

credit card system, it is a deceptive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for:

(1) A merchant to present to or deposit into, or cause another to present to or deposit into, the credit card system for payment, a credit card sales draft generated by a telemarketing transaction that is not the result of a telemarketing credit card transaction between the cardholder and the merchant;

(2) Any person to employ, solicit, or otherwise cause a merchant, or an employee, representative, or agent of the merchant, to present to or deposit into the credit card system for payment, a credit card sales draft generated by a telemarketing transaction that is not the result of a telemarketing credit card transaction between the cardholder and the merchant; or

(3) Any person to obtain access to the credit card system through the use of a business relationship or an affiliation with a merchant, when such access is not authorized by the merchant agreement or the applicable credit card system.

(d) *Prohibited deceptive acts or practices in the solicitation of charitable contributions.* It is a fraudulent charitable solicitation, a deceptive telemarketing act or practice, and a violation of this Rule for any telemarketer soliciting charitable contributions to misrepresent, directly or by implication, any of the following material information:

(1) The nature, purpose, or mission of any entity on behalf of which a charitable contribution is being requested;

(2) That any charitable contribution is tax deductible in whole or in part;

(3) The purpose for which any charitable contribution will be used;

(4) The percentage or amount of any charitable contribution that will go to a charitable organization or to any particular charitable program;

(5) Any material aspect of a prize promotion including, but not limited to: the odds of being able to receive a prize; the nature or value of a prize; or that a charitable contribution is required to win a prize or to participate in a prize promotion; or

(6) A charitable organization's or telemarketer's affiliation with, or endorsement or sponsorship by, any person or government entity.

§ 310.4 Abusive telemarketing acts or practices.

(a) *Abusive conduct generally.* It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for any seller or telemarketer to engage in the following conduct:

³ Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 *et seq.*, and Regulation Z, 12 CFR part 226.

⁴ Electronic Fund Transfer Act, 15 U.S.C. 1693 *et seq.*, and Regulation E, 12 CFR part 205.

⁵ For purposes of this Rule, the term "signature" shall include an electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent that such form of signature is recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law.

(1) Threats, intimidation, or the use of profane or obscene language;

(2) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration for goods or services represented to remove derogatory information from, or improve, a person's credit history, credit record, or credit rating until:

(i) The time frame in which the seller has represented all of the goods or services will be provided to that person has expired; and

(ii) The seller has provided the person with documentation in the form of a consumer report from a consumer reporting agency demonstrating that the promised results have been achieved, such report having been issued more than six months after the results were achieved. Nothing in this Rule should be construed to affect the requirement in the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. 1681, that a consumer report may only be obtained for a specified permissible purpose;

(3) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration from a person for goods or services represented to recover or otherwise assist in the return of money or any other item of value paid for by, or promised to, that person in a previous telemarketing transaction, until seven (7) business days after such money or other item is delivered to that person. This provision shall not apply to goods or services provided to a person by a licensed attorney;

(4) Requesting or receiving payment of any fee or consideration in advance of obtaining a loan or other extension of credit when the seller or telemarketer has guaranteed or represented a high likelihood of success in obtaining or arranging a loan or other extension of credit for a person;

(5) Disclosing or receiving, for consideration, unencrypted consumer account numbers for use in telemarketing; *provided*, however, that this paragraph shall not apply to the disclosure or receipt of a customer's or donor's billing information to process a payment for goods or services or a charitable contribution pursuant to a transaction;

(6) Causing billing information to be submitted for payment, directly or indirectly, without the express informed consent of the customer or donor. In any telemarketing transaction, the seller or telemarketer must obtain the express informed consent of the customer or donor to be charged for the goods or services or charitable contribution and to be charged using the identified account. In any telemarketing transaction involving preacquired account information, the requirements

in paragraphs (a)(6)(i) through (ii) of this section must be met to evidence express informed consent.

(i) In any telemarketing transaction involving preacquired account information and a free-to-pay conversion feature, the seller or telemarketer must:

(A) obtain from the customer, at a minimum, the last four (4) digits of the account number to be charged;

(B) obtain from the customer his or her express agreement to be charged for the goods or services and to be charged using the account number pursuant to paragraph (a)(6)(i)(A) of this section; and,

(C) make and maintain an audio recording of the entire telemarketing transaction.

(ii) In any other telemarketing transaction involving preacquired account information not described in paragraph (a)(6)(i) of this section, the seller or telemarketer must:

(A) at a minimum, identify the account to be charged with sufficient specificity for the customer or donor to understand what account will be charged; and

(B) obtain from the customer or donor his or her express agreement to be charged for the goods or services and to be charged using the account number identified pursuant to paragraph (a)(6)(ii)(A) of this section; or

(7) Failing to transmit or cause to be transmitted the telephone number, and, when made available by the telemarketer's carrier, the name of the telemarketer, to any caller identification service in use by a recipient of a telemarketing call; *provided* that it shall not be a violation to substitute (for the name and phone number used in, or billed for, making the call) the name of the seller or charitable organization on behalf of which a telemarketing call is placed, and the seller's or charitable organization's customer or donor service telephone number, which is answered during regular business hours.

(b) *Pattern of calls.*

(1) It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer to engage in, or for a seller to cause a telemarketer to engage in, the following conduct:

(i) Causing any telephone to ring, or engaging any person in telephone conversation, repeatedly or continuously with intent to annoy, abuse, or harass any person at the called number;

(ii) Denying or interfering in any way, directly or indirectly, with a person's right to be placed on any registry of names and/or telephone numbers of persons who do not wish to receive

outbound telephone calls established to comply with § 310.4(b)(1)(iii);

(iii) Initiating any outbound telephone call to a person when:

(A) that person previously has stated that he or she does not wish to receive an outbound telephone call made by or on behalf of the seller whose goods or services are being offered or made on behalf of the charitable organization for which a charitable contribution is being solicited; or

(B) that person's telephone number is on the "do-not-call" registry, maintained by the Commission, of persons who do not wish to receive outbound telephone calls to induce the purchase of goods or services unless the seller

(i) has obtained the express agreement, in writing, of such person to place calls to that person. Such written agreement shall clearly evidence such person's authorization that calls made by or on behalf of a specific party may be placed to that person, and shall include the telephone number to which the calls may be placed and the signature⁶ of that person; or

(ii) has an established business relationship with such person, and that person has not stated that he or she does not wish to receive outbound telephone calls under paragraph (b)(1)(iii)(A) of this section; or

(iv) Abandoning any outbound telephone call. An outbound telephone call is "abandoned" under this section if a person answers it and the telemarketer does not connect the call to a sales representative within two (2) seconds of the person's completed greeting.

(2) It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for any person to sell, rent, lease, purchase, or use any list established to comply with § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A), or maintained by the Commission pursuant to § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B), for any purpose except compliance with the provisions of this Rule or otherwise to prevent telephone calls to telephone numbers on such lists.

(3) A seller or telemarketer will not be liable for violating § 310.4(b)(1)(ii) and (iii) if it can demonstrate that, as part of the seller's or telemarketer's routine business practice:

(i) It has established and implemented written procedures to comply with § 310.4(b)(1)(ii) and (iii);

(ii) It has trained its personnel, and any entity assisting in its compliance, in

⁶ For purposes of this Rule, the term "signature" shall include an electronic or digital form of signature, to the extent that such form of signature is recognized as a valid signature under applicable federal law or state contract law.

the procedures established pursuant to § 310.4(b)(3)(i);

(iii) The seller, or a telemarketer or another person acting on behalf of the seller or charitable organization, has maintained and recorded a list of telephone numbers the seller or charitable organization may not contact, in compliance with § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(A);

(iv) The seller or a telemarketer uses a process to prevent telemarketing to any telephone number on any list established pursuant to §§ 310.4(b)(3)(iii) or 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B), employing a version of the "do-not-call" registry obtained from the Commission no more than three (3) months prior to the date any call is made, and maintains records documenting this process;

(v) The seller or a telemarketer or another person acting on behalf of the seller or charitable organization, monitors and enforces compliance with the procedures established pursuant to § 310.4(b)(3)(i); and

(vi) Any subsequent call otherwise violating § 310.4(b)(1)(ii) or (iii) is the result of error.

(4) A seller or telemarketer will not be liable for violating 310.4(b)(1)(iv) if:

(i) the seller or telemarketer employs technology that ensures abandonment of no more than three (3) percent of all calls answered by a person, measured per day per calling campaign;

(ii) the seller or telemarketer, for each telemarketing call placed, allows the telephone to ring for at least fifteen (15) seconds or four (4) rings before disconnecting an unanswered call;

(iii) whenever a sales representative is not available to speak with the person answering the call within two (2) seconds after the person's completed greeting, the seller or telemarketer promptly plays a recorded message that states the name and telephone number of the seller on whose behalf the call was placed⁷; and

(iv) the seller or telemarketer, in accordance with § 310.5(b)-(d), retains records establishing compliance with § 310.4(b)(4)(i)-(iii).

(c) *Calling time restrictions.* Without the prior consent of a person, it is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer to engage in outbound telephone calls to a person's residence at any time other than between 8:00 a.m. and 9:00 p.m. local time at the called person's location.

(d) *Required oral disclosures in the sale of goods or services.* It is an abusive

telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer in an outbound telephone call or internal or external upsell to induce the purchase of goods or services to fail to disclose truthfully, promptly, and in a clear and conspicuous manner to the person receiving the call, the following information:

(1) The identity of the seller;

(2) That the purpose of the call is to sell goods or services;

(3) The nature of the goods or services; and

(4) That no purchase or payment is necessary to be able to win a prize or participate in a prize promotion if a prize promotion is offered and that any purchase or payment will not increase the person's chances of winning. This disclosure must be made before or in conjunction with the description of the prize to the person called. If requested by that person, the telemarketer must disclose the no-purchase/no-payment entry method for the prize promotion; *provided*, however, that, in any internal upsell for the sale of goods or services, the seller or telemarketer must provide the disclosures listed in this section only to the extent that the information in the upsell differs from the disclosures provided in the initial telemarketing transaction.

(e) *Required oral disclosures in charitable solicitations.* It is an abusive telemarketing act or practice and a violation of this Rule for a telemarketer, in an outbound telephone call to induce a charitable contribution, to fail to disclose truthfully, promptly, and in a clear and conspicuous manner to the person receiving the call, the following information:

(1) The identity of the charitable organization on behalf of which the request is being made; and

(2) That the purpose of the call is to solicit a charitable contribution.

§ 310.5 Recordkeeping requirements.

(a) Any seller or telemarketer shall keep, for a period of 24 months from the date the record is produced, the following records relating to its telemarketing activities:

(1) All substantially different advertising, brochures, telemarketing scripts, and promotional materials;

(2) The name and last known address of each prize recipient and the prize awarded for prizes that are represented, directly or by implication, to have a value of \$25.00 or more;

(3) The name and last known address of each customer, the goods or services purchased, the date such goods or services were shipped or provided, and

the amount paid by the customer for the goods or services;⁸

(4) The name, any fictitious name used, the last known home address and telephone number, and the job title(s) for all current and former employees directly involved in telephone sales or solicitations; *provided*, however, that if the seller or telemarketer permits fictitious names to be used by employees, each fictitious name must be traceable to only one specific employee; and

(5) All verifiable authorizations or records of express informed consent or express agreement required to be provided or received under this Rule.

(b) A seller or telemarketer may keep the records required by § 310.5(a) in any form, and in the same manner, format, or place as they keep such records in the ordinary course of business. Failure to keep all records required by § 310.5(a) shall be a violation of this Rule.

(c) The seller and the telemarketer calling on behalf of the seller may, by written agreement, allocate responsibility between themselves for the recordkeeping required by this Section. When a seller and telemarketer have entered into such an agreement, the terms of that agreement shall govern, and the seller or telemarketer, as the case may be, need not keep records that duplicate those of the other. If the agreement is unclear as to who must maintain any required record(s), or if no such agreement exists, the seller shall be responsible for complying with §§ 310.5(a)(1)-(3) and (5); the telemarketer shall be responsible for complying with § 310.5(a)(4).

(d) In the event of any dissolution or termination of the seller's or telemarketer's business, the principal of that seller or telemarketer shall maintain all records as required under this Section. In the event of any sale, assignment, or other change in ownership of the seller's or telemarketer's business, the successor business shall maintain all records required under this Section.

§ 310.6 Exemptions.

(a) Solicitations to induce charitable contributions via outbound telephone calls are not covered by § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B) of this Rule.

(b) The following acts or practices are exempt from this Rule:

(1) The sale of pay-per-call services subject to the Commission's Rule

⁷ This provision does not affect any seller's or telemarketer's obligation to comply with relevant state and federal laws, including but not limited to the TCPA, 47 U.S.C. 227, and 47 CFR part 64.1200.

⁸ For offers of consumer credit products subject to the Truth in Lending Act, 15 U.S.C. 1601 *et seq.*, and Regulation Z, 12 CFR 226, compliance with the recordkeeping requirements under the Truth in Lending Act, and Regulation Z, shall constitute compliance with § 310.5(a)(3) of this Rule.

entitled "Trade Regulation Rule Pursuant to the Telephone Disclosure and Dispute Resolution Act of 1992," 16 CFR Part 308, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to the requirements of §§ 310.4(a)(1), (a)(7), (b), and (c);

(2) The sale of franchises subject to the Commission's Rule entitled "Disclosure Requirements and Prohibitions Concerning Franchising and Business Opportunity Ventures," ("Franchise Rule") 16 CFR Part 436, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to the requirements of §§ 310.4(a)(1), (a)(7), (b), and (c);

(3) Telephone calls in which the sale of goods or services or charitable solicitation is not completed, and payment or authorization of payment is not required, until after a face-to-face sales or donation presentation by the seller or charitable organization, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to the requirements of §§ 310.4(a)(1), (a)(7), (b), and (c);

(4) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor that are not the result of any solicitation by a seller, charitable organization, or telemarketer, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls;

(5) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to an advertisement through any medium, other than direct mail solicitation, *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to calls initiated by a

customer or donor in response to an advertisement relating to investment opportunities, business opportunities other than business arrangements covered by the Franchise Rule, or advertisements involving goods or services described in §§ 310.3(a)(1)(vi) or 310.4(a)(2)-(4); or to any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls;

(6) Telephone calls initiated by a customer or donor in response to a direct mail solicitation, including solicitations via the U.S. Postal Service, facsimile transmission, electronic mail, and other similar methods of delivery in which a solicitation is directed to specific address(es) or person(s), that clearly, conspicuously, and truthfully discloses all material information listed in § 310.3(a)(1) of this Rule, for any goods or services offered in the direct mail solicitation, and that contains no material misrepresentation regarding any item contained in § 310.3(d) of this Rule for any requested charitable contribution; *provided*, however, that this exemption does not apply to calls initiated by a customer in response to a direct mail solicitation relating to prize promotions, investment opportunities, business opportunities other than business arrangements covered by the Franchise Rule, or goods or services described in §§ 310.3(a)(1)(vi) or 310.4(a)(2)-(4); or to any instances of upselling included in such telephone calls; and

(7) Telephone calls between a telemarketer and any business, except calls to induce the retail sale of nondurable office or cleaning supplies; *provided*, however, that § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B) and § 310.5 of this Rule shall not apply to sellers or telemarketers of nondurable office or cleaning supplies.

§ 310.7 Actions by states and private persons.

(a) Any attorney general or other officer of a state authorized by the state to bring an action under the Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act, and any private person who brings an action under that Act, shall serve written notice of its action on the Commission, if feasible, prior to its initiating an action under this Rule. The notice shall be sent to the Office of the Director, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission, Washington, D.C. 20580, and shall include a copy of the state's or private person's complaint and any other pleadings to be filed with the court. If prior notice is not feasible, the state or private person shall serve the Commission with the required notice immediately upon instituting its action.

(b) Nothing contained in this Section shall prohibit any attorney general or other authorized state official from proceeding in state court on the basis of an alleged violation of any civil or criminal statute of such state.

§ 310.8 [Reserved: Fee for access to “do-not-call” registry.]**§ 310.9 Severability.**

The provisions of this Rule are separate and severable from one another. If any provision is stayed or determined to be invalid, it is the Commission’s intention that the remaining provisions shall continue in effect.

By direction of the Commission.

Donald S. Clark,
Secretary.

Note: Appendices A and B are published for informational purposes only and will not be codified in Title 16 of the Code of Federal Regulations.

Appendix A*List of Acronyms for Rule Review Commenters*

February 28, 2000 Request for Comment

Acronym — Commenter

AARP—AARP
 Alan—Alan, Alicia
 ARDA—American Resort Development Association
 ATA—American Teleservices Association
 Anderson—Anderson, Wayne
 Baressi—Baressi, Sandy
 Bell Atlantic—Bell Atlantic
 Bennett—Bennett, Douglas H.
 Biagiotti—Biagiotti, Mary
 Bishop—Bishop, Lew & Lois
 Blake—Blake, Ted
 Bowman-Kruhm—Bowman-Kruhm, Mary
 Braddick—Braddick, Jane Ann
 Brass—Brass, Eric
 Brosnahan—Brosnahan, Kevin
 Budro—Budro, Edgar
 Card—Card, Giles S.
 Collison—Collison, Doug
 Conn—Conn, David
 Conway—Conway, Candace
 Croushore—Croushore, Amanda
 Curtis—Curtis, Joel
 Dawson—Dawson, Darcy
 DMA—Direct Marketing Association
 DSA—Direct Selling Association
 Doe—Doe, Jane
 ERA—Electronic Retailing Association
 FAMSA—FAMSA-Funeral Consumers Alliance, Inc.
 Gannett—Gannett Co., Inc.
 Garbin—Garbin, David and Linda
 A. Gardner—Gardner, Anne
 S. Gardner—Gardner, Stephen
 Gibb—Gibb, Ronald E.
 Gilchrist—Gilchrist, Dr. K. James
 Gindin—Gindin, Jim
 Haines—Haines, Charlotte
 Harper—Harper, Greg
 Heagy—Heagy, Annette M.
 Hecht—Hecht, Jeff
 Hickman—Bill and Donna
 Hollingsworth—Hollingsworth, Bob and Pat
 Holloway—Holloway, Lynn S.
 Holmay—Holmay, Kathleen
 ICFA—International Cemetery and Funeral Association

Johnson—Johnson, Sharon Coleman
 Jordan—Jordan, April
 Kelly—Kelly, Lawrence M.
 KTW—KTW Consulting Techniques, Inc.
 Lamet—Lamet, Jerome S.
 Lee—Lee, Rockie
 LSAP—Legal Services Advocacy Project
 LeQuang—LeQuang, Albert
 Leshner—Leshner, David
 Mack—Mack, Mr. and Mrs. Alfred
 MPA—Magazine Publishers of America, Inc.
 Manz—Manz, Matthias
 McCurdy—McCurdy, Bridget E.
 Menefee—Menefee, Marcie
 Merritt—Merritt, Everett W.
 Mey—Mey, Diana
 Mitchelp—Mitchelp
 TeleSource—Morgan-Francis/Tele-Source Industries
 NACHA—NACHA-The Electronic Payments Association
 NAAG—National Association of Attorneys General
 NACAA—National Association of Consumer Agency Administrators
 NCL—National Consumers League
 NFN—National Federation of Nonprofits
 NAA—Newspaper Association of America
 NASAA—North American Securities Administrators Association
 Nova53—Nova53
 Nurik—Nurik, Margy and Irv
 PLP—Personal Legal Plans, Inc.
 Peters—Peters, John and Frederickson, Constance
 Reese—Reese Brothers, Inc.
 Reynolds—Reynolds, Charles
 Rothman—Rothman, Iris
 Runnels—Runnels, Mike
 Sanford—Sanford, Kanija
 Schiber—Schiber, Bill
 Schmied—Schmied, R. L.
 Strang—Strang, Wayne G.
 TeleSource—Morgan-Francis/Tele-Source Industries
 Texas—Texas Attorney General
 Thai—Thai, Linh Vien
 Vanderburg—Vanderburg, Mary Lou
 Ver Steegt—Ver Steegt, Karen
 Verizon—Verizon Wireless
 Warren—Warren, Joshua
 Weltha—Weltha, Nick
 Worsham—Worsham, Michael C., Esq.

Appendix B*List of Acronyms for NPRM Commenters**Acronym — Commenter*

1-800-DoNotCall—1-800-DoNotCall, Inc.
 AARP—AARP
 ACA—ACA International
 ACUTA—ACUTA
 Advanta—Advanta Corp.
 Aegis—Aegis Communications Group
 Alabama Police—Alabama State Police Association, Inc.
 AAST—American Association of State Troopers
 ABA—American Bankers Association
 ABIA—American Bankers Insurance Association
 American Blind—American Blind Products, Inc.
 ACE—American Council on Education
 ADA—American Diabetes Association
 AmEx—American Express

AFSA—American Financial Services Association
 Red Cross—American Red Cross
 ARDA—American Resort Development Association
 ARDA-2—American Resort Development Association-Do Not Call Registry
 American Rivers—American Rivers
 ASTA—American Society of Travel Agents
 ATA—American Teleservices Association
 Blood Centers—America’s Blood Centers
 Community Bankers—America’s Community Bankers
 Ameriquest—Ameriquest Mortgage Company
 Armev—Armev, The Honorable Dick (U.S. House of Representatives)
 AFP—Association of Fundraising Professionals
 APTS—Association of Public Television Stations
 ANA—Association of National Advertisers Associations—joint comment of: American Teleservices Association, Direct Marketing Association, Electronic Retailing Association, Magazine Publishers Association, and Promotion Marketing Association
 Assurant—Assurant Group
 Avinta—Avinta Communications, Inc.
 Ayres—Ayres, Ian
 Baldacci—Baldacci, The Honorable John Elias (U.S. House of Representatives)
 BofA—Bank of America
 Bank One—Bank One Corporation
 Beautyrock—Beautyrock, Inc.
 BellSouth—BellSouth Corporation
 Best Buy—Best Buy Company, Inc.
 BRI—Business Response Inc.
 CCAA—California Consumer Affairs Association
 CATS—Californians Against Telephone Solicitation
 Capital One—Capital One Financial Corporation
 Car Wash Guys—WashGuy Systems
 Carper—Carper, The Honorable Thomas R. (U.S. Senate)
 Celebrity Prime Foods—Celebrity Prime Foods
 Cendant—Cendant Corporation
 Chamber of Commerce—Chamber of Commerce of the United States of America
 CRF—Charitable Resource Foundation, Inc.
 Chicago ADM—Chicago Association of Direct Marketing
 Childhood Leukemia—Childhood Leukemia Foundation
 CDI—Circulation Development, Inc.
 CURE—Citizens United for Rehabilitation of Errants
 Citigroup—Citigroup Inc.
 Civil Service Leader—Civil Service Leader
 Collier Shannon—Collier Shannon Scott
 Comcast—Comcast
 CNHI—Community Newspaper Holdings, Inc.
 Community Safety—Community Safety, LLC
 Connecticut—Connecticut Commissioner of Consumer Protection
 CBA—Consumer Bankers Association
 CCC—joint comment of: Consumer Choice Coalition, ACI Telecentrics, Coverdell & Company, Discount Development Services, HSN LP d/b/a HSN and Home Shopping Network, Household Credit Services, MBNA America Bank, MemberWorks

- Incorporated, Mortgage Investors Corporation, Optima Direct, TCIM Inc., Trilegiant Corporation and West Corporation
- CMC—Consumer Mortgage Coalition
- Consumer Privacy—Consumer Privacy Guide
- Convergys—Convergys Corporation
- CCA—Corrections Corporation of America
- CASE—Council for Advancement and Support of Education
- Cox—Cox Enterprises
- Craftmatic—Craftmatic Organization, Inc.
- Davis—Davis, The Honorable Tom (U.S. House of Representatives)
- DBA—Debt Buyers Association
- DeHart—DeHart & Darr Associates
- Deutsch—Deutsch, The Honorable Peter (U.S. House of Representatives)
- DialAmerica—DialAmerica Marketing, Inc.
- DMA—Direct Marketing Association/U.S. Chamber of Commerce
- DMA-NonProfit—Direct Marketing Association NonProfit Federation
- DSA—Direct Selling Association
- Discover—Discover Bank
- DC—District of Columbia, Office of the People's Counsel
- Eagle—Eagle Bank
- EFSC—Electronic Financial Services Council
- EPIC—Joint comment: Electronic Privacy Information Center, Center for Digital Democracy, Junkbusters Corp., International Union UAW, Privacy Rights Clearinghouse, Consumers Union, Evan Hendricks of Privacy Times, Privacyactivism, Consumer Action, Consumer Project on Technology, Robert Ellis Smith of Privacy Journal, Consumer Federation of America, Computer Scientists for Social Responsibility, and Private Citizen, Inc.
- ERA—Electronic Retailing Association
- EPI—Enterprise Prison Institute
- Experian—Experian Marketing Information Solutions, Inc.
- Fiber Clean—Fiber Clean
- Roundtable—Financial Services Roundtable
- Fire Fighters Associations:
- Asheville FFA—Asheville (NC) Fire Fighters Association
- Bethlehem FFA—Bethlehem (PA), IAFF Local 735
- Boone FFA—Boone (IA)
- California FFA—California Professional Firefighters
- Cedar Rapids FFA—Cedar Rapids (IA), IAFF Local 11
- Cedar Rapids Airport FFA—Cedar Rapids Airport (IA)
- Chattanooga FFA—Chattanooga (TN) Fire Fighters Association, Local 820
- Edwardsville FFA—Edwardsville (IL) Fire Fighters Local 1700
- Greensboro FFA—Greensboro (NC)
- Hickory FFA—Hickory (NC) Firefighters Association, IAFF Local 2653
- Indiana FFA—Indiana, Professional Fire Fighters Union of
- Iowa FFA—Iowa Professional Firefighters
- Missouri FFA—Missouri State Council of Fire Fighters
- North Carolina FFA—North Carolina, Professional Fire Fighters & Paramedics of
- North Maine FFA—North Maine (Des Plaines, IL) Firefighters, IAFF Local 224
- Ottumwa FFA—Ottumwa (IA)
- Roanoke FFA—Roanoke (VA) Fire Fighters Association
- Springfield FFA—Springfield (MO) Firefighters Association, Local 52
- Sycamore FFA—Sycamore, IAFF Local 3046
- Utah FFA—Utah, Professional Firefighters of
- Vermont FFA—Vermont, Professional Firefighters of
- Wisconsin FFA—Wisconsin, Professional Fire Fighters of
- FireCo—FireCo, L.L.C.
- Fleet—FleetBoston Financial Corporation
- FOP—Fraternal Order of Police, Grand Lodge
- FPIR—Fund for Public Interest Research, Inc.
- FCA—Funeral Consumers Alliance, Inc.
- Gannett—Gannett Co., Inc.
- Gottschalks—Gottschalks, Inc.
- Greater Niagara—Greater Niagara Newspapers
- Green Mountain—Green Mountain Energy Company
- Gryphon—Gryphon Networks
- Hagel, Johnson & Carper—Joint letter from: The Honorable Chuck Hagel, Tim Johnson, and Thomas R. Carper (U.S. Senate)
- Hastings—Hastings, The Honorable Doc (U.S. House of Representatives)
- Herald Bulletin—Herald Bulletin
- Horick—Horick, Bob
- Household International:
- Household Auto—Joint comment: Household Finance Corp., OFL-A Receivables Corp., and Household Automotive
- Household Credit—Household Bank, Credit Card Services
- Household Finance—Household Finance Corporation
- Household-Montalvo—Montalvo, David
- HSBC—HSBC Bank USA
- Hudson Bay-Anderson—Hudson Bay Company of Illinois-owner
- Hudson Bay-Goodman—Hudson Bay Company-Goodman
- HRC—Human Rights Campaign
- IBM—IBM
- ICT—ICT Group, Inc.
- Illinois Police—Illinois Council of Police & Sheriffs
- Infocision—Infocision Management Corporation
- Inhofe—Inhofe, The Honorable James (U.S. Senate)
- Insight—Insight Realty, Inc.
- ITC—Interactive Teleservices Corp.
- ICFA—International Cemetery & Funeral Association
- IFA—International Franchise Association
- IUPA—International Union of Police Associations
- ICC—Internet Commerce Coalition
- Intuit—Intuit Inc.
- Italian American Police—Italian American Police Society of New Jersey
- Johnson—Johnson, The Honorable Tim (U.S. Senate)
- Kansas—Kansas, House of Representatives
- KeyCorp—KeyCorp.
- Lautman—Lautman & Associates
- LSAP—Legal Services Advocacy Project
- Leggett & Platt—Leggett & Platt
- Lenox—Lenox Inc.
- Leukemia Society—Leukemia & Lymphoma Society
- Life Share—Life Share
- Lucas—Lucas, The Honorable Ken (U.S. House of Representatives)
- MPA—Magazine Publishers Association
- Make-A-Wish—Make-A-Wish Foundation of America
- Manzullo—Manzullo, The Honorable Donald A. (U.S. House of Representatives)
- March of Dimes—March of Dimes Birth Defects Foundation
- Marketlink—Marketlink, Inc.
- MBA—Massachusetts Bankers Association
- MasterCard—MasterCard International
- MBNA—MBNA America Bank, N.A.
- McClure—McClure, Scott
- McConnell—McConnell, The Honorable Mitch (U.S. Senate)
- Metris—Metris Companies, Inc.
- Michigan Nonprofit—Michigan Nonprofit Association
- MidFirst—MidFirst Bank
- MBAA—Mortgage Bankers Association of America
- Myrick—Myrick, The Honorable Sue (U.S. House of Representatives)
- NACHA—NACHA-The Electronic Payments Association
- Nadel—Nadel, Mark S. (law review article: "Rings of Privacy: Unsolicited Telephone Calls and the Right to Privacy," 4 *Yale Journal on Regulation* 99 (Fall 1986))
- NAAG—National Association of Attorneys General
- NACAA—National Association of Consumer Agency Administrators
- NAIFA—National Association of Insurance & Financial Advisors
- NAR—National Association of Realtors
- NARUC—National Association of Regulatory Utility Commissioners
- ARVC—National Association of RV Parks & Campgrounds
- NASCO—National Association of State Charity Officials
- NASUCA—National Association of State Utility Consumer Advocates
- E-Commerce Coalition—National Business Coalition on E-Commerce & Privacy
- NCTA—National Cable & Telecommunications Association
- National Children's Cancer—National Children's Cancer Society, Inc.
- NCLC—Joint comment: National Consumer Law Center, National Association of Consumer Advocates, Consumer Federation of America, Consumers Union, and US Public Interest Research Group
- NCLF—National Children's Leukemia Foundation
- NCL—National Consumers League
- NEMA—National Energy Marketers Association
- NFPPA—National Family Privacy Protection Association
- NFIB—National Federation of Independent Business
- NFC—National Franchise Council
- NFDA—National Funeral Directors Association
- NNA—National Newspaper Association of America
- NPMA—National Pest Management Association
- NPR—National Public Radio
- NRF—National Retail Federation
- NTC—National Troopers Coalition
- Nelson—Nelson, The Honorable E. Benjamin (U.S. Senate)
- NetCoalition—NetCoalition

- Nethercutt—Nethercutt, The Honorable George R., Jr. (U.S. House of Representatives)
- NeuStar—NeuStar, Inc.
- New Orleans—New Orleans, City Council of (CNO)-Utility, Cable & Telecommunications Committee
- NJ Police—New Jersey Police Officers Foundation, Inc.
- NYSCPB—New York State Consumer Protection Board
- NAA—Newspaper Association of America
- Nextel—Nextel Communications, Inc.
- Ney, Sandlin, Jones, Shows and Cantor—Joint letter from: The Honorable Bob Ney, Max Sandlin, Walter Jones, Ronnie Shows, and Eric Cantor (U.S. House of Representatives)
- Noble—Noble Systems
- NATN—North American Telephone Network LLC
- NC Zoo—North Carolina Zoological Society
- Not-For-Profit Coalition—Not-For-Profit and Charitable Coalition
- NSDI—NSDI Teleperformance
- OSU—Ohio State University
- OTC—Ohio Troopers Coalition
- Pacesetter—Pacesetter Corporation
- PVA—Paralyzed Veterans of America
- Paramount—Paramount Lists, Inc.
- Pascrell—Pascrell, The Honorable Bill, Jr. (U.S. House of Representatives)
- Patrick—Patrick, George W.
- Paul—Paul, The Honorable Ron (U.S. House of Representatives)
- Pelland—Pelland, Paul
- PLP—Personal Legal Plans, Inc.
- Michigan Police—Police Officers Association of Michigan
- possibleNOW—possibleNOW.com, Inc.
- PRC—Privacy Rights Clearinghouse
- Private Citizen—Private Citizen, Inc.
- Proctor—Proctor, Alan
- PBP—Progressive Business Publications
- PCIC—Progressive Casualty Insurance Company
- Angel Food—Project Angel Food
- PMA—Promotion Marketing Association
- Purple Heart—Purple Heart Service Foundation, Military Order of
- Ramstad—Ramstad, The Honorable Jim (U.S. House of Representatives)
- Redish—Redish, Martin H., Esq.
- Reed Elsevier—Reed Elsevier Inc.
- Reese—Reese Brothers, Inc.
- SBC—SBC Communications Inc.
- Schrock—Schrock, The Honorable Edward L. (U.S. House of Representatives)
- Sensenbrenner—Sensenbrenner, The Honorable F. James, Jr. (U.S. House of Representatives)
- SHARE—SHARE
- SIIA—Software & Information Industry Association
- Southerland—Southerland, Inc.
- Southern Poverty—Southern Poverty Law Center
- Special Olympics—Special Olympics, Inc.
- SO-AZ—Special Olympics Arizona
- SO-CA—Special Olympics Southern California
- SO-CO—Special Olympics Colorado
- SO-CN—Special Olympics Connecticut
- SO-IA—Special Olympics Iowa
- SO-KY—Special Olympics Kentucky
- SO-MD—Special Olympics Maryland
- SO-MO—Special Olympics Missouri
- SO-MT—Special Olympics Montana
- SO-NH—Special Olympics New Hampshire
- SO-NJ—Special Olympics New Jersey
- SO-NM—Special Olympics New Mexico
- SO-NY—Special Olympics New York
- SO-VT—Special Olympics Vermont
- SO-VA—Special Olympics Virginia
- SO-WA—Special Olympics Washington
- SO-WI—Special Olympics Wisconsin
- SO-WY—Special Olympics Wyoming
- Spiegel—Spiegel, Marilyn
- Stage Door—Stage Door Music Productions, Inc.
- Statewide Appeal—Statewide Appeal Inc.
- Success Marketing—Success Marketing, Inc.
- Synergy Global—Synergy Global Networks, The
- Synergy Solutions—Synergy Solutions, Inc.
- Sytel—Sytel Limited
- Tate—Tate & Associates
- Technion—Technion Communications Corp
- TDI—Telecommunications for the Deaf, Inc.
- TeleDirect—TeleDirect International, Inc.
- Telefund—Telefund, Inc.
- Teleperformance—Teleperformance USA
- TRC—Tele-Response Center
- TeleStar—TeleStar Marketing, L.P.
- TRA—Tennessee Regulatory Authority
- Terry—Terry, The Honorable Lee (U.S. House of Representatives)
- Texas Environment—Texas Campaign for the Environment
- Texas PUC—Texas Office of Public Utility Counsel
- Thayer—Thayer, Richard E., Esq.
- Time—Time, Inc.
- Tribune—Tribune Publishing Company
- UNICOR—UNICOR: (Federal Prison Industries, Inc, DOJ, Federal Bureau of Prisons)
- DOJ—U.S. Department of Justice
- Uniway—Uniway of Coastal Georgia
- Verizon—Verizon Companies
- Virginia—Virginia Attorney General
- VISA—VISA U.S.A., Inc.
- Watts—Watts, The Honorable J.C., Jr. (U.S. House of Representatives)
- Weber—Weber, Ron & Associates, Inc.
- Wells Fargo—Wells Fargo & Company
- White—White, David T.
- WTA—Wisconsin Troopers' Association Inc.
- Worsham—Worsham, Michael C., Esq.
- YPIMA—Yellow Pages Integrated Media Association (YPIMA)
- Supplemental Comments*
- AARP-Supp.—AARP
- AOP-Supp.—Aircraft Owners and Pilots Association (Marsha Mason-Thies)
- Allstate-Supp.—Allstate Life Insurance Company
- Community Bankers-Supp.—America's Community Bankers
- AICR-Supp.—The American Institute for Cancer Research (Kathryn L. Ward)
- Red Cross-Supp.—American Red Cross
- ARDA-Supp.—The American Resort Development Association (Yartin DePoy and Stratis Pridgeon)
- ATA-Supp.—American Teleservices Association
- Associations-Supp.—Associations Letter
- Avinta-Supp.—Avinta (Abe Chen)
- Bond-Supp.—Bond, The Honorable Christopher S. (U.S. Senate)
- Celebrity Prime Foods-Supp.—Celebrity Prime Foods
- Chesapeake-Supp.—The Chesapeake Bay Foundation (Amelia Koch and Melissa Livingston)
- Christian Appalachian-Supp.—The Christian Appalachian Project
- Comic Relief-Supp.—Comic Relief, Inc. (Dennis Albaigh)
- Covington & Burling-Supp.—Covington and Burling
- DialAmerica-Supp.—DialAmerica Marketing, Inc.
- DMA Letter-Supp.—Direct Marketing Association-Transmittal Letter
- DMA Study-Supp.—Direct Marketing Association-Study
- ERA and PMA-Supp.—Electronic Retailing Association and Promotion Marketing Association
- EPI-Supp.—Enterprise Prison Institute
- Domenici-Supp.—Domenici, The Honorable Pete V. (U.S. Senate)
- FDS-Supp.—Federation Department Stores
- Hoar-Supp.—Hoar, Wesley C.
- Illinois-Supp.—Illinois Attorney General's Office
- ICTA-Supp.—Industry Council for Tangible Assets
- Luntz-Supp.—Luntz Research Companies (Chrys Lemon)
- MPA-Supp.—Magazine Publishers of America
- Maryland-Supp.—Maryland Attorney General's Office (Carol Beyers)
- McIntyre-Supp.—McIntyre Law Firm, PLLC (Chrys Lemon)
- McKenna-Supp.—McKenna, Douglas M.
- Memberworks-Supp.—Memberworks National Survey Topline (Chrys Lemon)
- Minnesota-Supp.—Minnesota Attorney General's Office
- Missouri-Supp.—Missouri Attorney General's Office
- NACDS-Supp.—National Association of Chain Drug Stores
- Ney, Sandlin, Jones, Shows and Cantor-Supp.—Joint letter from: The Honorable Bob Ney, Max Sandlin, Walter Jones, Ronnie Shows, and Eric Cantor (U.S. House of Representatives)
- NAR-Supp.—National Association of Realtors
- NWF-Supp.—National Wildlife Federation
- NAA June 28-Supp.—Newspaper Association of America (John F. Sturm)
- NAA July 31-Supp.—Newspaper Association of America
- Not-For-Profit Coalition-Supp.—Not-For-Profit and Charitable Coalition
- PMA-Supp.—Promotion Marketing Association
- Putnam-Supp.—Putnam, The Honorable Adam H. (U.S. House of Representatives)
- Riley-Supp.—Riley, The Honorable Bob (U.S. House of Representatives)
- SBC-Supp.—SBC Communications Inc.
- Time-Supp.—Time, Inc.
- Vermont-Supp.—Vermont Attorney General's Office
- WWF-Supp.—World Wildlife Fund (Deborah Hechinger)
- Worsham-Supp.—Worsham, Michael C.
- User Fee Comments*
- AARP-User Fee—AARP

ABA-User Fee—American Bankers Association
 Red Cross-User Fee—American Red Cross
 ARDA-User Fee—American Resort Development Association
 ATA-User Fee—American Teleservices Association
 Community Bankers-User Fee—America's Community Bankers
 Ameriquest-User Fee—Ameriquest Mortgage Company
 Celebrity Prime Foods-User Fee—Celebrity Prime Foods
 CBA-User Fee—Consumer Bankers Association
 DialAmerica-User Fee—DialAmerica Marketing, Inc.
 DMA Letter-User Fee—Direct Marketing Association
 DMA Comments-User Fee—Direct Marketing Association
 Discover-User Fee—Discover Bank
 ERA/PMA-User Fee—Electronic Retailing Association and Promotion Marketing Association (joint comment)
 Household-User Fee—Household Bank (SB), N.A. and Household Bank (Nevada), N.A. (joint comment)
 Hudson Bay-User Fee—Hudson Bay Company of Illinois, Inc.
 ICTA-User Fee—Industry Council for Tangible Assets
 InfoCision-User Fee—InfoCision Management Corporation
 ITC-User Fee—Interactive Teleservices Corporation
 MPA-User Fee—Magazine Publishers of America
 MasterCard-User Fee—MasterCard International, Inc.
 NACDS-User Fee—National Association of Chain Drug Stores
 NAR-User Fee—National Association of Realtors
 NASUCA-User Fee—National Association of State Utility Consumer Advocates
 NEMA-User Fee—National Energy Marketers Association
 Not-For-Profit Coalition-User Fee—Not-For-Profit and Charitable Coalition
 SBC-User Fee—SBC Communications, Inc.
 Tennessee-User Fee—Tennessee Regulatory Authority
 SBA-User Fee—United States Small Business Administration, Office of Advocacy
 Visa-User Fee—Visa U.S.A., Inc.
 Wells Fargo-User Fee—Wells Fargo & Company

Concurring Statement of Commissioner Orson Swindle in *Telemarketing Sales Rule*, File No. R411001

I wholeheartedly support the amendments to the Telemarketing Sales Rule (“TSR”), because I believe that they will help protect consumers from deceptive and abusive telemarketing practices. In particular, these amendments will give consumers the ability to avoid the sheer volume of unwanted telemarketing calls that many consider to be a nuisance. I write separately to explain my views on two issues — how the Commission determines whether an act or practice is

“abusive” for purposes of the TSR, and the national do-not-call registry.

Abusive Telemarketing Acts or Practices

The Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act (“Telemarketing Act”) directs the Commission to promulgate rules that prohibit “deceptive telemarketing acts or practices and other abusive telemarketing acts or practices.” 15 U.S.C. 6102 (a)(1). To determine what constitutes an abusive telemarketing practice, the Commission for the most part has used the examples of abusive practices that Congress provided in the Telemarketing Act and principles drawn from these examples. I agree that this is an appropriate analysis, and in light of the rulemaking record as a whole, I fully support the TSR amendments that fall within these parameters. These amendments include, among other things, the provisions involving the national do-not-call registry, transmission of caller identification information, and abandoned calls and predictive dialers.

When the Commission seeks to identify practices as abusive that are less distinctly within the parameters of the Act’s examples and their emphasis on privacy protection, the Commission employs its traditional unfairness analysis.¹ I understand the Commission’s intention to narrow the potentially expansive scope of the term “abusive” by using its unfairness analysis. However, given the broad ordinary meaning of the term “abusive,” I believe that the standard for determining what constitutes an abusive telemarketing practice likely is broader than the stringent definition of the term “unfair.” Therefore, I would have preferred it had the Commission looked to the plain meaning of the term “abusive” and then formulated a separate standard to identify abusive

¹ Given that nothing in the language of the Telemarketing Act or its legislative history indicates that Congress intended the Commission to use its unfairness standard to determine which practices are abusive, I previously raised concerns about this analysis and requested comment on this issue. *Concurring Statement of Commissioner Orson Swindle in Telemarketing Sales Rule Review*, File No. R411001, available at (www.ftc.gov/os/2002/01/swindletsrstatement.htm). Although some comments agreed with this concern, they did not offer an alternative analysis of abusive practices beyond suggesting that the Commission’s authority is limited to the examples of abusive practices included in the Telemarketing Act and its legislative history. See *Statement of Basis and Purpose* at 100, n. 428. However, because the Act does not limit the Commission’s authority to identify abusive practices to the examples in the Act, the Commission may prohibit other practices that it identifies as abusive.

telemarketing practices for purposes of the Telemarketing Act and the TSR.

Nevertheless, I agree with the Commission’s conclusion that a telemarketing practice that meets the strict unfairness standard will constitute an abusive practice for purposes of the Act and the TSR. In light of the rulemaking record, I therefore support the TSR amendments that are analyzed under this standard. This includes the requirement that telemarketers obtain consumers’ or donors’ express informed consent before causing their information to be submitted for payment. The rulemaking record evidences the harm that results from unauthorized billing, the need for the consent requirement, and the need to mandate specific steps that telemarketers must take to obtain consumers’ consent in transactions involving preacquired account information.

In addition, the record supports the prohibition on the disclosure or receipt, for consideration, of unencrypted account numbers for use in telemarketing (except to process a payment for goods or services or a charitable contribution pursuant to a transaction). I do not believe that the mere disclosure of personal financial information, without more, causes or is likely to cause substantial consumer injury. In this situation, however, the rulemaking record provides a basis for concluding that trafficking in unencrypted account numbers is likely to cause substantial consumer injury in the form of unauthorized billing. Industry comments state that there is no legitimate reason to purchase unencrypted lists of credit card numbers. Therefore, there is a strong likelihood that telemarketers who do engage in this practice will misuse the information in a manner that results in unauthorized charges to consumers’ accounts. The Commission’s law enforcement experience corroborates this conclusion.² As a result, I conclude that this practice is abusive for purposes of the Telemarketing Act.

The National Do-Not-Call Registry

The Telemarketing Act and the TSR recognize consumers’ “right to be let alone.” See, e.g., *Olmstead v. U.S.*, 277 U.S. 438, 478 (1928) (Brandeis, J., dissenting) (stating that the “right to be let alone” is the “most comprehensive of rights and the right most valued by

² See *Statement of Basis and Purpose* at 97-98. In addition, given the evidence that the use of encrypted account information in telemarketing can result in unauthorized charges, there is an even greater likelihood that injury will occur when a telemarketer has obtained, for consideration, consumers’ actual credit card numbers.

civilized men”). In the context of telemarketing, there is an inherent tension between this right and the First Amendment’s right to free speech. With this in mind, and in light of the rulemaking record as a whole, the Commission has determined to establish a national do-not-call registry. This will enable consumers to stop certain telemarketing calls — calls to induce the purchase of goods and services from companies within the FTC’s jurisdiction (except where the consumer has an “established business relationship” with the seller).

Although the USA PATRIOT Act of 2001 gave the Commission authority to regulate for-profit companies that make telephone calls seeking charitable donations on behalf of charities, the Commission has determined to exempt these entities from the national do-not-call registry requirements. Instead, the Commission requires these telemarketers to comply with the “entity-specific” do-not-call provision, which prohibits them from calling

consumers who have said they do not want to be called by or on behalf of a particular entity. This more narrowly tailored approach seeks to protect consumers from unwanted telemarketing calls seeking charitable donations, while minimizing the impact of the TSR on charities’ First Amendment rights. I do not object to taking this approach at the outset; but if there is evidence that suggests that this approach is not effective in protecting consumers from unsolicited telemarketing calls, the Commission should revisit this decision and require for-profit telemarketers seeking charitable donations to comply with the national do-not-call registry.

While I believe that the amended TSR and the national do-not-call registry will go a long way to help consumers prevent unwanted intrusions into their homes, a number of entities are not subject to the TSR’s requirements. Under the Telemarketing Act and the TSR, the Commission does not have jurisdiction in whole or in part over the

calls of entities such as banks, telephone companies, airlines, insurance companies, credit unions, charities, political campaigns, and political fund-raisers. From the perspective of consumers, the right to be let alone is invaded just as much by unwanted calls from exempt entities (e.g., banks, telephone companies, or political fund-raisers) as it is by such calls from covered entities.³ Therefore, I believe that the entire spectrum of entities that make telemarketing calls to consumers should be subject to do-not-call requirements.

[FR Doc. 03-1811 Filed 1-28-03; 8:45 am]

BILLING CODE 6750-01-S

³ The Federal Communications Commission, however, has requested comment on whether to establish a national do-not-call registry that would address telemarketing calls by at least some of the entities that are exempt from the FTC’s jurisdiction. *Notice of Proposed Rulemaking*, Rules and Regulations Implementing the Telephone Consumer Protection Act of 1991, 67 FR 62667 (Oct. 8, 2002).